Detailed Contents

Acknowledgements xiii

Introduction 1
§1 The problem of copredication: three challenges 1
§1.1 The truth challenge 3
§1.2 The counting and individuation challenge 3
§1.3 The category mistake challenge 6
§2 Accounts of copredication: a brief overview 7
§3 The Property Versatility approach to copredication 11
§4 Property Versatility beyond copredication 18
§5 How this book is structured 20
§6 Routes through this book 21
§7 Relation to previous work 22

I. DUAL NATURE APPROACHES TO COPREDICATION

1. Introduction to Dual Nature Approaches 27

2. Asher's Theory of Copredication 31
§1 Asher's theory summarized 31
§2 Objections to Asher's metaphysics 38
§3 Empirical objections to Asher's theory 44
§3.1 The truth-conditions of counting sentences 45
§3.1.1 Multiple readings of a single counting sentence 45
§3.1.2 Copredication sentences involving counting of aspects 47
§3.1.3 Copredication cases involving counting of P•I objects 51
§3.1.4 Potential solutions? 52
§3.2 Talking about informational books 55
§3.3 Category mistakes and copredication 58
§3.3.1 Asher's account of category mistakes 59
§3.3.2 Distinguishing between repairable and irreparable type shifts on Asher's system 61

OC REVIEW

3. Gotham's Theory of Copredication 64
§1 Gotham's theory summarized 64
§2 Objections to Gotham's metaphysics 71
§3 Empirical objections to Gotham's theory 77
§3.1 The truth-conditions of counting sentences 77
§3.1.1 Multiple readings of a single counting sentence 77
§3.1.2 Counting involving copredication: double-distinctness 78
§3.1.3 Potential solutions? 81
§3.2 Talking about informational books 86
§3.2.1 Talking about informational books on Gotham's original theory 87
§3.2.2 Adding i-books to the extension of 'book'? 89
§3.3 Gotham's account of category mistakes 90

4. Additional Dual Nature Approaches and Concluding Remarks 96
§1 Cooper's Type Theory with Records 96
§2 Chatzikyriakidis and Luo's Modern Type Theories 101
§3 Concluding remarks 104

II. ADDITIONAL APPROACHES TO COPREDICATION

5. Reinterpretation Approaches 109
§1 Reinterpretation approaches to copredication 109
§2 Against Reinterpretation approaches 111
§2.1 Applying a predicate to multiple types 113
§2.2 More complex predicates 114
§2.3 Overgeneration 116
§2.4 Generalizing the objections 117
§3 Against reinterpretation as meaning transfer 118
§3.1 Evidence against a meaning transfer account 118
§3.2 A rejoinder: odd conjunctions? 121

6. Scepticism about Externalist Semantics 123
§1 Chomskyan internalism 123
§2 The arguments from copredication to internalism 124
§2.1 The argument from implausible beliefs 126
§2.2 The argument from individuation conditions 130
§2.3 The argument from counting 134
§3 Internalism and the challenges posed by copredication 136

OC REVIEW

§3.1 The truth challenge 137
§3.2 The counting and individuation challenge 140
§3.3 The category mistake challenge 141
§3.4 Truth-conditions and truth-makers 143
§3.5 Copredication as semantic illusion 144
§4 Internalism and the Property Versatility account 148

7. Polysemy, Copredication, and Polysemy-centric Approaches 150
§1 Polysemy and copredication 150
§2 Polysemy is neither necessary nor sufficient for copredication 153
§3 Ortega-Andrés and Vicente's Polysemy-centric account 154
§4 Predicate order effects: an argument in favour of Polysemy-centric approaches? 160
§5 Copredication and semantic variability 164
§5.1 Copredication without semantic variability: the case of 'school' 165
§5.2 Copredication and context-sensitivity: the case of 'book' 168
§5.3 Copredication with polysemy: the case of 'lunch' 172
§6 Explaining the (tentative) link between copredication and semantic variability 174
§7 Polysemy does not fail the zeugma ambiguity tests 175
§7.1 Zeugma tests and their philosophical applications 176
§7.2 The alleged failure of the zeugma tests for polysemy 179
§7.3 The Property Versatility approach and the ambiguity tests 180
§7.4 Ambiguity tests revisited 182

III. THE PROPERTY VERSATILITY APPROACH TO COPREDICATION

8. The Property Versatility Approach 187
§1 The Property Versatility approach 187
§2 Addressing the challenges posed by copredication 189
§2.1 The truth challenge 189
§2.2 The counting and individuation challenge 193
§2.3 The category mistakes challenge 198
§2.4 The Property Versatility approach and the phenomenon of copredication 202
§3 The metaphysics of Property Versatility 205
§3.1 Locating the controversy 205
§3.2 Arguments against Property Versatility 206

OUP REVIEW

§3.2.1 The argument from general principles 207
§3.2.2 The argument from paradigmatic cases 210
§3.2.3 The argument from category mistakes 211
§3.3 Inheritance as a model for versatility 211
§3.4 Property Versatility and the metaphysics of properties 215
§3.5 Whither theorizing? 216

9. The Property Versatility Approach: Detailed Case Studies 219
§1 Lunch was delicious but took hours 220
§2 The easy way and the hard way: walking through doors and drinking bottles 224
§3 Fine-grained informational books 229
§4 Against double-distinctness 234
§4.1 How Property Versatility could accommodate double-distinctness 235
§4.2 Against double-distinctness 236
§4.3 New data in favour of double-distinctness? 239
§4.4 Explaining away the allure of double-distinctness 240
§5 Surprising contrasts in counting sentences 242
§6 Books burned and memorized 244
§7 Books on shelves and counters 247
§8 Too much versatility? 249
§8.1 An intriguing example 250
§8.2 The problem generalized 257

IV. THE PROPERTY VERSATILITY VIEW OF GENERICS

10. The Property Versatility View of Generics Motivated 263
§1 Property Versatility and generics 263
§2 In favour of PVG: the arguments from copredicational generics and Generic Conjunction Introduction 267
§3 Kind-predications are kind predications 272
§4 Characterizing sentences are kind predications: the argument from notational variants 275
§5 Characterizing sentences are kind predications: arguments from counting 277
§5.1 The witness argument 278
§5.2 The embedding argument 280
§6 Characterizing sentences are kind predications: anaphora and relative clauses 280

QC REVIEW

Liebesman191124_BITS_ATUK.indd 10 16-Apr-25 20:35:22

§7 In favour of Versatility: ellipsis and predicate anaphora 282
§8 Conclusion and remaining challenges 284

11. The Property Versatility View of Generics Defended 285
§1 Pronouns and binding 286
§2 Scope ambiguity? 291
§2.1 Typhoons arise in this part of the pacific 292
§2.2 Storks have a favourite nesting area 300
§3 Negation, scope, and generic excluded middle 305
§4 Context-sensitivity 313
§5 Weak crossover 318
§6 Substitution failure 320
§7 Conclusion 321

V. PROPERTY VERSATILITY AND SOCIAL ONTOLOGY

12. The Metaphysics of Establishments 325
§1 Establishments and copredication 325
§2 The uniformity question 326
§3 Two case studies: restaurants and geopolitical entities 329
§3.1 Restaurants 329
§3.2 Geopolitical Entities 340
§4 Establishments and the material/immaterial distinction 342

13. The Metaphysics of Repeatable Artworks 345
§1 Repeatable artworks 345
§2 Extant positions 346
§3 Mixed-level property ascriptions on immaterialist views 348
§3.1 Analogical predication 349
§3.2 Mixed-level ascriptions as containing generic quantification 352
§3.3 Mixed-level ascriptions as ascribing versatile properties 354
§4 Mixed-Level property ascriptions on materialist views 356
§5 The impact of versatility on extant arguments 358
§5.1 Location and materiality 359
§5.2 Perception 359
§5.3 Creating repeatable artworks 361
§6 Property Versatility and the metaphysics of repeatable artworks 363
§7 Beyond the category question 367
Appendix: Responding to Kleinschmidt and Ross's Objections 368

OC REVIEW

Liebesman191124_BITS_ATUK.indd 11 16-Apr-25 20:35:22

14. Property Versatility and Fictional Discourse 373
§1 Accounts of fictional discourse 374
§1.1 Extant accounts 375
§1.2 The Property Versatility account of fictional discourse 378
§2 The problem of mixed perspectives 380
§3 Against the Property Versatility account of fictional discourse 388
§3.1 Impossible and inconsistent fictions 388
§3.2 Inconsistencies between parafictional and metafictional truths 391
§3.3 Real-world objects appearing in fiction 392
§4 Concluding remarks 394

VI. FURTHER APPLICATIONS OF PROPERTY VERSATILITY

15. Further Applications of Property Versatility 399
§1 The statue and the clay 399
§2 The metaphysics of languages and words 403
§3 Collective intentionality 407
§4 Philosophy of perception 411

References 417
Index of terms 429
Index of names 431
Index of central examples 433

QC REVIEW